

REPORT ON STRATEGIC DIRECTIONS IN COMPUTING RESEARCH PROJECT

Peter Wegner, Brown University
February 1997

This project involved an in-depth examination of strategic directions of computing research through the organization of a conference held at MIT in June 1996 and a report on that conference in *Computing Surveys* of December 1996 (Volume 28, No. 4). The project grew in scale from the initially planned meeting of about 100 people in five areas to a meeting of 300 leading researchers in 22 areas. The report likewise grew in scale and comprised over 300 hard-copy pages of the December issue of *Surveys* with an electronic supplement of over 600 pages including position statements. The Table of Contents of the *Surveys* issue is given below and a draft of the Table of Contents for the electronic supplement (*Computing Surveys* Volume 28, No. 4es) is attached. The electronic supplement is available through <http://www.acm.org/surveys>. We would be happy to send complimentary copies of the hard-copy *Computing Surveys* to individuals selected by you.

ACM 50th-Anniversary Issue, December 1996
Strategic Directions in Computing Research

Foundations

Strategic Directions in Theory of Computation, *Michael Loui et al.*
Strategic Directions in Computational Geometry, *Roberto Tamassia et al.*
Strategic Directions in Concurrency Research, *Rance Cleaveland, Scott Smolka et al.*
Strategic Directions in Formal Methods, *Edmund M. Clarke, Jeannette M. Wing et al.*
Strategic Directions in Programming Languages, *Chris Hankin, Hanne Riis Nielson, Jens Palsberg et al.*
Strategic Directions in Artificial Intelligence, *Jon Doyle, Thomas Dean et al.*

Systems

Strategic Directions in Computer Architecture, *Trevor Mudge et al.*
Strategic Directions in Networks and Telecommunications, *David Clark, Joseph Pasquale et al.*
Strategic Directions in Object-Oriented Programming, *Rachid Guerraoui et al.*
Strategic Directions in Constraint Programming, *Pascal Van Hentenryck, Vijay Saraswat et al.*
Strategic Directions in Software Engineering and Programming Languages, *Carl Gunter, John Mitchell, David Notkin et al.*
Strategic Directions in Software Quality, *Leon Osterweil et al.*
Strategic Directions in Real-Time and Embedded Systems, *John A. Stankovic et al.*
Strategic Directions in Database Systems – Breaking Out of the Box, *Avi Silberschatz, Stanley Zdonik et al.*
Strategic Directions in Storage I/O Issues in Large-Scale Computing, *Garth A. Gibson, Jeffrey Scott Vitter, John Wilkes et al.*

Applications and Infrastructure

Strategic Directions in Human-Computer Interaction, *Brad Myers, Jim Hollan, Isabel Cruz et al.*
Strategic Directions in Computational Science and Engineering, *Ahmed Sameh et al.*
Strategic Directions in Electronic Commerce and Digital Libraries: Toward a Digital Agora, *Nabil Adam, Yelena Yesha et al.*
Strategic Directions in Computer Science Education, *Allen B. Tucker et al.*

ACM Computing Surveys: Contents of Volume 28A(4)
Special Issue Devoted to Position Statements
on Strategic Directions in Computing Research

December 1996

Each entry indicates the author or authors, the title, and an abbreviated URL (for the full URL, prefix <http://www.acm.org/surveys/1996>). The abbreviated URL is a composite of the author's name and the area of the position statement.

Artificial Intelligence

Ronald J. Brachman and Hector J. Levesque, Undirected Behavior Without Unbounded Search, /BrachmanAI/

Thomas L. Dean, Integrating Theory and Practice in Planning, /DeanAI/

Tom Dietterich, Machine Learning, /DietterichAI/

Jon Doyle, Cleaving (Unto) Artificial Intelligence, /DoyleAI/

Cordell Green, Formality Helps Scalability and Robustness, /GreenAI/

Barbara J. Grosz, The Importance of Integration for AI, /GroszAI/

Ian Horswill, Integrated Systems and Naturalistic Tasks, /HorswillAI/

Daphne Koller, Structured Representations and Intractibility, .
/KollerAI/

Fernando Pereira, Language, Computation and Artificial Intelligence,
/PereiraAI/

Bart Selman, Computational Challenges in Artificial Intelligence,
/SelmanAI/

Yoav Shoham, The Open Scientific Borders of AI and the Case of Economics,
/ShohamAI/

Howard E. Shrobe, Two Challenging Domains, /ShrobeAI/

William R. Swartout, Future Directions in Knowledge-Based Systems,
/SwartoutAI/

Michael P. Wellman, The Economic Approach to Artificial Intelligence,
/WellmanAI/

Shlomo Zilberstein, Resource-Bounded Reasoning in Intelligent Systems,
/ZilbersteinAI/

Computational Geometry

Pankaj K. Agarwal and Subhash Suri, Simple and Practical Geometric Algorithms,
/AgarwalCG/

Nancy M. Amato, Equipping CAD/CAM Systems with Geometric Intelligence,
/AmatoCG/

Danny Z. Chen, Developing Algorithms and Software for Geometric Path Planning Problems, /ChenCG/

Ioannis G. Tollis, Graph Drawing and Information Visualization, /TollisCG/

Jeffrey S. Vitter, Communication Issues in Large-Scale Geometric Computation, /VitterCG/

Computational Science and Engineering

George Cybenko, Large-scope Computing: The Industrial Challenges, /CybenkoCSE/

Malvin Kalos, Challenges in Computational Science, /KalosCSE/

Kenneth Neves, Thoughts on CSE Candidates for Industrial Positions, /NevesCSE/

John R. Rice, Computational Science as One Driving Force for All Aspects of Computing Research, /RiceCSE/

Francis Sullivan, From Theory to Practice, /SullivanCSE/

Computer Architecture

Tom Conte, Importance of Profiling and Compatibility, /ConteCA/

Joel Emer, Incremental Versus Revolutionary Research, /EmerCA/

Matt Farrens, Distributed Decentralized Computing, /FarrensCA/

Dirk Grunwald, Embedded, General-Purpose, and High-Performance Systems, /GrunwaldCA/

Kai Li, Applications, Storage Hierarchy, and Integration, /LiCA/

Jack Mills, An Industrial Perspective on Computer Architecture, /MillsCA/

David Nagel, Synergy Between Software and Hardware, /NagleCA/

Yale Patt, Microarchitecture, Compilers and Algorithms, /PattCA/

Jim Smith, Multiscalar as a New Architecture Paradigm, /SmithCA/

Wen-Hann Wang, Microprocessor Architecture Challenges -- The Best is Yet to Come!, /WangCA/

David Wood, Problems, Challenges and the Importance of Performance Evaluation, /WoodCA/

Robert Yung, The Importance of Process Technology to Microarchitecture, /YungCA/

Concurrency

Rajeev Alur, Next Steps in Formal Verification, /AlurCONCUR/

Jos C.M. Baeten and Jan A. Bergstra, Six Issues Concerning Future Directions in Concurrency Research, /BaetenCONCUR/

Eike Best, Some Major Dichotomies Relating to Future Research in Concurrency, /BestCONCUR/

Rance Cleaveland, Semantic Theories and System Design, /CleavelandCONCUR/

Roberto Gorrieri, On the Power of Concurrency Theory, /GorrieriCONCUR/

Mohamed G. Gouda, Network Protocols between Exact Specifications and Pragmatic Implementations, /GoudaCONCUR/

Jan Friso Groote, Concurrency Theory Will Set Standards for Description and Analysis of Software, /GrooteCONCUR/

Thomas A. Henzinger, Some Myths About Formal Verification, /HenzingerCONCUR/

C.A.R. Hoare, Unifying Theories: A Personal Statement, /HoareCONCUR/

David Luginbuhl, Issues in Concurrent Systems Research, /LuginbuhlCONCUR/

Dale Miller, Logical Foundations for Open System Design, /MillerCONCUR/

Jayadev Misra, A Discipline of Multiprogramming, /MisraCONCUR/

Faron Moller, Logics for Concurrency: Structure Versus Automata, /MollerCONCUR/

Ugo Montanari, Causal Computing, /MontanariCONCUR/

Rocco De Nicola and Scott A. Smolka, Concurrency: Theory and Practice, /DeNicolaCONCUR/

Sanjiva Prasad, Models for Mobile Computing Agents, /PrasadCONCUR/

Vaughan R. Pratt, Concurrency Concepts: An Ongoing Search, /PrattCONCUR/

Joseph Sifakis, Research Directions for Concurrency, /SifakisCONCUR/

Bernhard Steffen and Tiziana Margaria, Method Engineering for Real-Life Concurrent Systems, /SteffenCONCUR/

Bent Thomsen, Programming Languages, Analysis Tools, and Concurrency Theory, /ThomsenCONCUR/

Pierre Wolper, Where is the Algorithmic Support?, /WolperCONCUR/

Constraint Programming

Vijay Saraswat, Compositional Computing, /SaraswatCP/

Pascal Van Hentenryck, Constraint Programming for Combinatorial Search Problems, /VanHentenryckCP/

Alexander Brodsky, Constraint Databases: Promising Technology or Just Intellectual Exercise?, /BrodskyCP/

Philippe Codognet, The Virtuality of Constraints and the Constraints of Virtuality, /CodognetCP/

Manuel Hermenegildo, Some Challenges for Constraint Programming, /HermengildoCP/

Alan Mackworth, Constraint-Based Design of Embedded Intelligent Systems,
/MackworthCP/
Ken McAloon, Constraint-Based Programming, /McAloonCP/
D. McAllester, The Rise of Nonlinear Mathematical Programming, /McAllesterCP/
Ugo Montanari and Francesca Rossi, Constraint Solving and Programming: What's
Next?, /MontanariCP/
W. Older, CLP(Interval), /OlderCP/
Gert Smolka, Constraints in OZ, /SmolkaCP/
Jean-Francois Puget, Future of Constraint Programming, /PugetCP/
R. Ramakrishnan, Constraints in Databases, /RamakrishnanCP/
R. Dechter, Bucket Elimination: a Unifying Framework for
Processing Hard and Soft Constraints, /DechterCP/
M. Dincbas, Constraint Programming, /DincbasCP/
E. Freuder, In Pursuit of the Holy Grail, /FreuderCP/
J. Jaffar and R. Yap, Constraint Programming 2000, /JaffarCP/
S. Kasif, A Constraint-Based Engineering Framework for Algorithm Design and
Application, /KasifCP/

Databases

Jose Blakeley, Thoughts on Directions in Database Research, /BlakeleyDB/
Tomasz Imielinski, Directions in Databases, /ImielinskiDB/
Sushil Jajodia, Managing Security and Privacy of Information, /JajodiaDB/
Henry F. Korth, New Focal Points for Research in Database Systems, /KorthDB/
Guy M. Lohman, You Think Your DBMS is Complex Now...?, /LohmanDB/
David Lomet, A Role for Research in the Database Industry, /LometDB/
Frank Manola, Transforming the Database System Into an Open Service Concept,
/ManolaDB/
M. Tamer Ozsu, Future of Database Systems: Changing Applications and
Technological Developments, /OzsuDB/
Raghu Ramakrishnan, Some Promising Directions for Database Research,
/RamakrishnanDB/
Krithi Ramamritham, Application-Oriented Database Support,
/RamamrithamDB/
Hans-J. Schek, Improving the Role of Future Database Systems, /SchekDB/
Richard T. Snodgrass, The Inefficiency of Misalignment, /SnodgrassDB/
Jeff Ullman, Moving Database Theory Into Database Practice, /UllmanDB/

Education

Owen Astrachan, Education Goals and Priorities, /AstrachanEDU/

Kim Bruce, Thoughts on Computer Science Education, /BruceEDU/

Robert Cupper, A Revised Curriculum Framework, /CupperEDU/

Peter Denning, Business Designs of the University, /DenningEDU/

Scot Drysdale, What Should We Teach?, /DrysdaleEDU/

Charles Kelemen, First Courses for Nonmajors and Public Understanding of Computer Science, /KelemenEDU/

Catherine McGeoch, Research in the Curriculum, and the Web, /McGeochEDU/

Yale Patt, First Courses and Fundamentals, /PattEDU/

Richard Proulx and Richard Rasala, The Future of Computer Science Education, /ProulxEDU/

Roy Rada, Calling for a Virtual Computing College, /RadaEDU/

Eric Roberts, Directions in Computer Science Education, /RobertsEDU/

Lynn Andrea Stein, Interactive Programming: Revolutionizing Introductory Computer Science, /SteinEDU/

Allen Tucker, Crisis in Computer Science Education, /TuckerEDU/

Electronic Commerce/Digital Libraries

Nabil R. Adam and Shamim Naqvi, Universal Access in Digital Libraries, /AdamECDL/

Baruch Awerbuch, Maximizing Gross Network Product (GNP): Resource Management on the GII, /AwerbuchECDL/

Karen Bennet and Jacob Slonim, The Electronic Commerce Position Paper, /BennetECDL/

Alex Brodsky, Constraint Database Technology for Electronic Trade with Complex Objectives, /BrodskyECDL/

Robert Grossman, Data Mining Challenges for Digital Libraries, /GrossmanECDL/

Barbara Blaustein, Cathy McCollum, and Arnon Rosenthal, Flexible Security Policies for Digital Libraries /BlausteinECDL/

Jim Johnson, The Physics of Politics in the Information Age, /JohnsonECDL/

Anna-Lena Neches, The Future of Electronic Commerce: A Pragmatic View, /NechesECDL/

Ouri Wolfson, Infrastructure and Cost Models for Digital Libraries, /WolfsonECDL/

Howard D. Wactlar, The Next Generation Electronic Library---Capturing the Experience, /WactlarECDL/

Formal Methods

Rajeev Alur, Next Steps in Formal Verification, /AlurFM/
Edmund Clarke and Jeannette M. Wing, Tools and Partial Analysis, /ClarkeFM/
Rance Cleaveland, Formality and Software Design, /CleavelandFM/
Steven German, Research Goals for Formal Methods, /GermanFM/
Thomas A. Henzinger, Some Myths About Formal Verification, /HenzingerFM/
Gerard Holzmann, On-the-Fly Model Checking, /HolzmannFM/
Cliff Jones, Formal Methods Light, /JonesFM/
Doron Peled, User Interfaces for Formal Methods, /PeledFM/
John Rushby, Enhancing the Utility of Formal Methods, /RushbyFM/
Joseph Sifakis, Safety, Security and Quality, /SifakisFM/
Prasad Sistla, Hybrid and Incremental Modelchecking Techniques, /SistlaFM/
Bernhard Steffen and Tiziana Margaria, Tools Get Formal Methods Into Practice, /SteffenFM/
Pierre Wolper, The Meaning of "Formal", /WolperFM/
Jim Woodcock, Software Engineering Research Directions, /WoodcockFM/

Human-Computer Interaction

Steve Bryson, Implications of Near-Real-Time Three-Dimensional Interfaces, /BrysonHCI/
Dick C.A. Bulterman, Making the Technology Serve the User, /BultermanHCI/
Tiziana Catarci, Databases and the Web: New Requirements for an Easy Access, /CatarciHCI/
Wayne Citrin, Strategic Directions in Visual Languages Research, /CitrinHCI/
Isabel F. Cruz, Tailorable Information Visualization, /CruzHCI/
Ephraim P. Glinert, R. Lindsay Todd and G. Bowden Wise, The Adaptive Multi-interface Multimodal Environment, /GlinertHCI/
Jonathan Grudin, The End of Exile, /GrudinHCI/
James D. Hollan, Strategic Issues for Human-Computer Interaction, /HollanHCI/
Yannis E. Ioannidis, Visual User Interfaces for Database Systems, /IoannidisHCI/
Robert J.K. Jacob, The Future of Input Devices, /JacobHCI/

Bonnie E. John, Evaluating Usability Evaluation Techniques, /JohnHCI/
David Kurlander, Thoughts on User Interface Research Processes and Agendas,
/KurlanderHCI/
Brad A. Myers, Programmability and Heuristics in the User Interface, /MyersHCI/
Dan R. Olsen Jr., Computational Resources and the Internet, /OlsenHCI/
Stuart M. Shieber, A Call for Collaborative Interfaces, /ShieberHCI/
Ben Shneiderman, Advanced Graphic User Interfaces: Elastic and Tightly Coupled
Windows, /ShneidermanHCI/
John Stasko, Future Research Directions in Human-Computer Interaction,
/StaskoHCI/
Gary W. Strong, Human-Centered Information Systems (HCIS), /StrongHCI/
Kent Wittenburg, The WWW Information Glut: Implications for Next-Generation HCI
Technologies, /WittenburgHCI/

Storage I/O for Large-Scale Computing

Alok Choudhary and David Kotz, Large-Scale File Systems with the Flexibility of
Databases, /ChoudharyIO/
Thomas H. Cormen and Michael T. Goodrich, A Bridging Model for Parallel
Computation, Communication, and I/O, /CormenIO/
M. Satyanarayanan and Carla Schlatter Ellis, Adaptation: The Key to Mobile I/O,
/SatyanarayananIO/
Garth A. Gibson and John Wilkes, Self-Managing Network-Attached Storage,
/GibsonIO/
Richard R. Muntz and Joseph Pasquale, System-level Design Issues for Storage
I/O, /MuntzIO/
Darren Erik Vengroff and Jeffrey Scott Vitter, I/O-Efficient Algorithms and
Environments, /VengroffIO/

Object-Oriented Programming

M. Aksit, Separation and Composition of Concerns in the Object-Oriented Model,
/AksitOOP/
A. P. Black, Object-Oriented Languages: The Next Generation, /BlackOOP/
L. Cardelli, Bad Engineering Properties of Object-Oriented Languages,
/CardelliOOP/
P. Cointe, Reflective Languages and MetaLevel Architectures, /CointeOOP/
J. Coplien, Broadening Beyond Objects to Patterns and to Other Paradigms,
/CoplienOOP/
R. Guerraoui, Distributed Programming Abstractions, /GuerraouiOOP/
G. Kiczales, Aspect-Oriented Programming, /KiczalesOOP/

D. Lea, Specification, Architecture, and Interoperability, /LeaOOP/
K. Lieberherr, From Transience to Persistence in Object-Oriented Programming:
Architectures and Patterns, /LieberherrOOP/
O. Madsen, Strategic Research Directions in Object-Oriented Programming,
/MadsenOOP/
B. Magnusson, Technologies Integration, /MagnussonOOP/
J. Meseguer, Why OOP Needs New Semantic Foundations, /MeseguerOOP/
H. Moessenboeck, Trends in Object-Oriented Programming, /MoessenboeckOOP/
J. Palsberg, Compiler Technology for Object-Oriented Languages, /PalsbergOOP/
D. Schmidt, Using Design Patterns to Guide the Development of Reusable
Object-Oriented Software, /SchmidtOOP/

Programming Languages

Luca Cardelli, Global Computation, /CardelliPL/
Charles Consel, Program Adaptation Based on Program Transformation, /ConselPL/
Patrick Cousot, Program Analysis: The Abstract Interpretation Perspective,
/CousotPL/
Michael Hanus, Integration of Declarative Paradigms: Benefits and Challenges,
/HanusPL/
Robert Harper and John Mitchell, ML and Beyond, /HarperPL/
Daniel Le Metayer, Program Analysis for Software Engineering: New Applications,
New Requirements, New Tools, /MetayerPL/
Flemming Nielson, Perspectives on Program Analysis, /NielsonPL/
Martin Odersky, Challenges in Type Systems Research, /OderskyPL/
Robert Paige, Future Directions in Program Transformations, /PaigePL/
Alberto Pettorossi and Maurizio Proietti, Future Directions in Program
Transformation, /PettorossiPL/
John Reynolds, Beyond ML, /ReynoldsPL/
Jon G. Riecke, Semantics: The Description of Computational Structures,
/RieckePL/
Barbara Ryder, The Future of Program Analysis, /RyderPL/
David A. Schmidt, On the Need for a Popular Formal Semantics, /SchmidtPL/
Dennis Volpano, Provably Secure Programming Languages for Remote Evaluation,
/VolpanoPL/
Reinhard Wilhelm, Program Analysis -- A Toolmaker's Perspective, /WilhelmPL/

Real-Time Computing

Jack Stankovic, The Pervasiveness of Real-Time Computing, /StankovicRT/
Alan Burns, Broadening Real-Time Systems Research, /BurnsRT/
Kevin Jeffay, Technical and Educational Challenges for Real-Time Computing,
/JeffayRT/
Mike Jones, Consumer Real-Time Systems, /JonesRT/
John Lehoczky, Analytical Methods for Real-Time Computing, /LehoczkyRT/
Jane Liu, Validation of Timing Properties, /LiuRT/
Gary Koob, Large-Scale Distributed Real-Time Systems, /KoobRT/
Al Mok, Firm Real-Time Systems, /MokRT/
Krithi Ramamritham, Predictability: Demonstrating Real-Time Properties,
/RamamrithamRT/
Lui Sha, Real-Time in the Real World, /ShaRT/
Insup Lee, Formal Verification, Testing and Checking of Real-Time Systems,
/LeeRT/
Andre van Tilborg, Real-Time Research in the Department of Defense, /TilborgRT/

Software Engineering and Programming Languages

Gregory Abowd, Software Engineering and Programming Language Considerations for
Ubiquitous Computing, /AbowdSEPL/
Luca Cardelli, Bad Engineering Properties of Object-Oriented Languages,
/CardelliSEPL/
Craig Chambers, Towards Reusable, Extensible Components, /ChambersSEPL/
Lori A. Clarke and Peri Tarr, New Functionality for Programming Languages,
/ClarkeSEPL/
William G. Griswold, Richard Wolski, Scott B. Baden, Stephen J. Fink, and
Scott R. Kohn, Programming Language Requirements for the Next Millennium,
/GriswoldSEPL/
Robert Harper and Peter Lee, Research in Programming Languages for
Composability, Safety, and Performance, /HarperSEPL/
Paul Hudak, Building Domain-Specific Embedded Languages, /HudakSEPL/
Sam Kamin, The Challenge of Language Technology Transfer, /KaminSEPL/
Gregor Kiczales, Aspect-Oriented Programming, /KiczalesSEPL/
Karl Lieberherr, From Transience to Persistence in Object-Oriented Programming:
Architectures and Patterns, /LieberherrSEPL/
Melody M. Moore, Representation Issues for Reengineering Interactive Systems,
/MooreSEPL/
Jens Palsberg, Software Evolution and Integration, /PalsbergSEPL/

. Bill Scherlis, Beyond Coding, /ScherlisSEPL/

Jack Wileden, Programming Languages and Software Engineering: Past, Present and Future, /WiledenSEPL/

Software Quality

Lori A. Clarke, How Do We Improve Software Quality and How Do We Show That it Matters?, /ClarkeSQ/

Richard A. DeMillo, Mission-Critical Applications, Commercial Value and Software Quality, /DeMilloSQ/

William McKeeman, Separating Concerns in Software Quality, /McKeemanSQ/

Edward F. Miller, Jr., Getting Quality Methods Into Practice, /MillerSQ/

Telecommunications

Paul Green, The Impact of the Web on Networking Research, /GreenTEL/

Jim Kurose, Future Directions in Networking Research, /KuroseTEL/

Joseph Pasquale, Towards Internet Computing, /PasqualeTEL/

Theory of Computation

Dana Angluin, A 1996 Snapshot of Computational Learning Theory, /AngluinTOC/

Faith Fich, Infrastructure Issues Related to Theory of Computing Research, /FichTOC/

Oded Goldreich and Avi Wigderson, Theory of Computing: A Scientific Perspective, /GoldreichTOC/